BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
3 1761 10084344 0

EMPLOYMENT LAW

by

PROFESSOR BRIAN LANGILLE

Faculty of Law
University of Toronto
Toronto, Ontario

September, 1982

AJ
L35
1982

LAW LIBRARY
SEP 17 1982
FACULTY OF LAW
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

FACULTY OF LAW LIBRARY
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

EMPLOYMENT LAW

by

PROFESSOR BRIAN LANGILLE

Faculty of Law
University of Toronto
Toronto, Ontario

September, 1982

Digitized by the Internet Archive
in 2018 with funding from
University of Toronto

https://archive.org/details/employmentlaw00lang

EMPLOYMENT LAW

Table of Contents

I. INTRODUCTION

A. Fuller and Purdue, The Reliance Interest in Contract Damages, (1936), 46 Yale L.J. 52 1

B. A.A. Leff, Economic Analysis of Law: Some Realism About Nominalism, 60 Virginia L.R. 451 1

II. WORK, EMPLOYMENT, AND THE "PROPER" LEGAL ANALYSIS

A. General

1. Studs Terkel, Working (1972) 3

2. Seabrook, Unemployment (1982) 13

3. Beatty, Labour is Not a Commodity, in Studies in Contract Law, Reiter and Swan eds. (1980) 13

4. Questions 19

5. Wood and Kumar, The Current Industrial Relations Scene in Canada (1981) 20

(a) Unemployment 20
(b) Labour Force Profile 21
(c) Women in the Work force 23
(d) Male/Female Comparisons 26
(e) Self-Employment 29
(f) Unionism 30

6. Contract/Status debate 32

(a) Posner, The Economics of Justice (1981) 33
(b) Rawls, A Theory of Justice (1971) 35
(d) Scanlon, Liberty, Contract and Contribution in Market and Morals, Dworkin, Berment, Brown eds. (1977) 35

(e) Beatty, Labour is Not a Commodity 36

Questions

(f) Tuohy and Trebilcock Policy Options in the Regulations of Asbestos-related Health Hazards (1982) 46

B. Contractual Analysis

1. Christie, Employment Law in Canada (1981) 51

2. Arthur, Carter, Glazbeek, Labour Law and Industrial Relations in Canada, (1981) 51

3. Freedland, The Contract of Employment (1976) 51

4. MacNeil, The Many Futures of Contract, (1974), 47 S. Cal. L. Rev. 691 54

5. Fox, Beyond Contract: Work, Power and Trust Relations (1974) 61b

III. THE SEARCH FOR THE "ESSENCE" OF THE EMPLOYMENT RELATIONSHIP AND THE ANSWER TO THE QUESTION "IS THIS PERSON AN EMPLOYEE?"

A General

(1) Christie, Employment Law 64
(2) Kahn - Freund, (1951) 14 Mod. L. Rev. 67
(3) Davis and Freedland Labour Law: Text and Materials (1979) 68

(4) Re Becker Milk Co. Ltd. (1973) 1.L.A.C. (2d) 337 68

(5) Re Becker Milk Co. Ltd. 41 D.L.R. (3d) 503 78

B The Importance of Avoiding Formalism 83

1 N.L.R.B. v. Hearst Publications (1944) 322 U.S. 111 83

2 Ontario Labour Relations Act s. 2(h),(i) 87

3 Denham v. Midland Employers' Mutual Assurance Ltd. [1955] 2 Q.B. 437 87

4 International Longshoreman's Association v. Maritime Employers' Association (1978) 89 D.L.R. (3d) 289 92

5. Bowmaster and Whitewater Drilling 95

6. Problem 97

IV. HIRING 99

A. General 99

1. Christie, Employment Law 99

2. Freedland, The Contract of Employment 100

B. Discrimination in Hiring 105

1. Posner, Economics of Justice 105

2. Dworkin, Taking Rights Seriously 109

3. Fallon, To Each According to his Ability From None According to his Race: The Concept of Merit in Anti-Discrimination Law (1980), 60 Boston College L. Rev. 815 114

4. The Common Law 119

(a) Board of Governors of Seneca College v. Bhadauria (1981) 124 D.L.R. (3d) 193 119

5. Statutes 128

(a) Griggs v. Duke Power Co. 401 U.S. 424 (1971) 128

Questions 134

(b) Ontario Human Rights Commission v. Simpson Sears (1982), 36 O.R. (2d) 59 135

(c) Statistical Evidence 149

(i) Sullivan, Zimmer, Richards, Federal Statutory Law of Employment Discrimination (1980) 149

(ii) Re Windsor Board of Education (1982), 3 L.A.C. (2d) 426 (Gorsky) 164

(d) Dothard v. Rawlinson 433 U.S. 321 (1977) 178

6. The Constitution 188

(a) Corwin, The Constitution and What It Means Today (19th ed., 1978) 189

7. Affirmative Action 190

Athabasca Tribal Council v. Amoco

a) [1980] 5 W.W.R. 165 (Alta. C.A.) 191

b) (1981) 124 D.L.R. (3d) 1 (S.C.C.) 214

V. THE CONTENT OF THE EMPLOYMENT RELATIONSHIP (EMPLOYER AND EMPLOYEE RIGHTS AND OBLIGATIONS) 219

Fox, Beyond Contract 220

A. Express Obligations and Their Variation 221

K.M.A. Catering Ltd. v. Howie (1968) 1 D.L.R. (3d) 558 222

B. Restrictive Covenants 225

Christie, Employment Law 231

C. An Aside About Pensions and Their Regulation

1. Christie, Employment Law 231

2. Arthurs, Carter, Glazbeek 233

3. City of L.A. v. Manhart 435 U.S. 702 (1978) 235

D. A Note About Implied Obligations in General

1. Christie, Employment Law 242

2. Note on Obedience 249

E. Competence

1. Cassidy v. Ministry of Health [1951] 2 K.B. 343 250

2. Lister v. Romford Ice [1957] A.C. 555 257

3. Sealand of the Pacific Ltd. v. McHaffie (1974), 51 D.L.R. (3d) 262

4. D.H. Overmyer v. Wallace Transfer (1975) 65 D.L.R. (3d) 717 263

5. Markovits, Law or Order - Constitutionalism and Legality in Eastern Europe (1982), 34 Stanford L. Rev. 513 266

F. Fidelity, Inventions, Competition, Trade Secrets, Confidential Information, Fiduciary Obligations, and Bribes

1. Robb v. Green [1895] 2 Q.B. 315 270

2. State Vacuum Stores v. Phillips [1954] D.L,R. 621 271

3. Triplex Safety Glass Co. v. Scorah [1938] 1 Ch. 211 281

4. Christie, Employment Law 281

5. Reading v. A.G. [1951] A.C. 507 288

6. Can-Aero v. O'Malley (1973) 40 D.L.R. (3d)371 289

VI TERMINATION 311

A. Introduction

1. Beatty, Labour is Not a Commodity 312

2. Swinton, Contract Law and The Employment Relationship: The Proper Forum for Reform in Reiter and Swan, Studies 315

B. Expiration of a Fixed Term and Agreed Periods of Notice

1. Christie, Employment Law 320

2. Christopher and CKXM-FM 326

3. Nardocchio v. Canadian Imperial Bank of Commerce (1979) 41 N.S.R. (2d) 26 332

4. What about retirement? 347

C. Firing

1. Termination with Due Notice or Pay in Lieu

(a) Christie, Employment Law 348

(b) Employment Standards Act, s. 40(a) 361

2. Summary Dismissal (Dismissal with Cause) and Wrongful Dismissal

(a) Christie, Employment Law 363

(b) Laws v. London Chronicle [1959] 2 All E.R. 205 373

3. Quitting, Constructive Dismissal (Quitting for for Cause) and Variation 377

(a) Christie, Employment Law 377

(b) Thomas Marshall Exports v. Guinle [1979] 1 Ch. 227 379

(c) Gould v. Hermes Electronics (1978) 34 N.S.R. (2d) 321 388

(d) Baker v. Burns Foods Ltd. (1977), 74D.L.R. (3d) 762 399

(e) Peerless Laundry v. Neal [1953] 2 D.L.R. 494 402

(f) Hill v. Peter Gorman (1957) 9 D.L.R. (2d) 124 406

4. Remedies for Wrongful Dismissal 418

(a) Christie, Employment Law 418

(b) McMinn v. Town of Oakville (1978), O.R. (2d) 366 440

(c) Pilon v. Peugot (1980) 29 O.R. (2d) 711 448

(d) Jorgenson v. Jack Cewe Ltd. [1980] 1 S.C.R. 812 449

(e) General Billposting v. Atkinson [1909] A.C. 118 461

(f) Harris, Wrongful Dismissal (2d ed. 1980) 466

5. Pause for Reflection

(a) Beatty, Labour is not a Commodity 474

6. Discipline 489

(a) Hanley v. Pease and Partners Ltd. [1915] 1 K.B. 698 490

(b) Adams, Grievance Arbitration of Discharge Cases 491

7. Canada Labour Code s. 61.5

(a) Robert v. Bank of Nova Scotia 1 L.A.C. (3d) 259 500

(b) Walker v. Canadian Imperial Bank of Commerce 510

(c) S. 61.5 Case Statistics 540

8. Frustration

(a) Christie, Employment Law 543

(b) Question 550

9. Employer Going Out of Business

(a) Nokes v. Doncaster Amalgamated Collieries [1940] A.C. 1014 551

(b)Christie, Employment Law 551

10. Layoff, Suspension, Lockout

(a) Christie, Employment Law 561

11. Prohibited Dismissals

(a) Age Discrimination 570

(i) Ontario Human Rights Commission v. Borough Etobicoke 40 N.R. 159 570

(ii) Tuohy v. Ford Motor Co. (1980) 580

(b) Sexual harassment 581

(i) Cox and Corwell v. Super Great Submarine 3 C.H.R.R. D/609 581

VII. HEALTH AND SAFETY 590

A. From the Common Law to Workmen's Compensation

1. Marshment v. Borgstrom 590

2. Ottoman Bank v. Chakarian 599

3. Prosser, The Law of Torts 605

4. Farwell v. Boston and Worcester Railroad Corp. 609

5. Legislative Reform 612

B. Why Regulation? 615

1. Gunderson and Swinton, Collective Bargaining and Asbestos Dangers at the Workplace 615

2. Some Information

a) Advisory Council on Occupational Health and Safety. Fourth Annual Report 634

b) Ison, The Dimensions of Industrial Disease 641

c) Advisory Council, Fourth Annual Report 648

d) P. Kinnersly, The Hazards of Work: How to Fight Them 650

C. The Form of Regulation 651

1. Standard Setting

a) S. Kelman, Regulating America, Regulating Sweden 651

b) Kelman, "Cost Benefit Analysis: An Ethical Critique 654

c) Delong, "Defending Cost Benefit Analysis 661

d) Tuohy and Trebilcock, Policy Options in the Regulation of Asbestos Related Health Hazards 663

e) TLV's- CCH Employment Safety Reporter 675

f) "Lead Regulation" - Advisory Council. Fourth Annual Report 677

2. Enforcement

a) Annual Report, Ontario Ministry of Labour, 1980-81 688

b) Ontario Ministry of Labour. Operations Manual 689

3. Self Help

a) Right to Know - Note, "Occupational Health Risks and the Workers Right to Know" 690

b) Right to Refuse 697

i) Pharand v. Inco Metalc 697
ii) Problem 716

4. Criminal Law

i) Criminal Code s. 201 717

D. Interaction of Health and Safety with Sex Discrimination 717

VIII. THE RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN THE CONTRACT OF EMPLOYMENT AND COLLECTIVE BARGAINING

A. McGavin Toastmaster v. Ainscough 719

B. Re Telegram Publishing Co. and Swelling 724

C. Downey v. Scotia Square Hotel Ltd. 734

D. Brunet v. General Motors 738

E. Employment Law Statutes 739

IX. CONSTITUTIONAL DIVISION OF POWERS

A. A B C Triology 740

1. Arrow Transfer 740

2. Westcoast Transmission 746

3. Canadian Telephone and Supplies 750

B. A Further Problem 754

1. Marathon Realty 754

2. Problem 758

X. PAY

A. The Obligation to Pay 759

1. Common Law 759

a) Dartmouth Ferry Commissioners v. Marks 759

2. Statutory Control 765

a) General Comments 765

b) Minimum Wage 766

i) Heilbroner, The Economic Problem 767

c) Hours of Work and Overtime Pay 768

d) Recovery of Unpaid Pay 768

i) Procedures under the Employment Standards Act 769

- Ontario Ministry of Labour Annual Report 1980-81 770
- Re Downing and Graydon 771

e) Actual Recovery - Insolvency and Priorities 781

i) In General

- Christie, Employment Law in Canada 781

ii) In Ontario

- Employment Standards Act, s. 14 783
- Campeau v. Provincial Bank 783

iii) The Statutory Trust 789

- Employment Standards Act, s. 15 789
- Re Dairy Maid Chocolates 789
- MacMillan v. Frizzel Plumbing and Heating 792

iv) Statutory Lien or Charge 796

- Homeplan Realty v. Avco Financial Services 797
- Employment Standards Act S.B.C. 1980 798

f) Equal Pay 799

i) Data 799
ii) Avenues of Redress 802
iii) Ontario Law and Beyond 802

- Re Harris and Bell Canada 802
- R. v. Howard, Exp. Municipality of Metropolitan Toronto 803
- Gunderson, The Male-Female Earnings Gap in Ontario: A Summary 805